Home Exercises for the course "Identification of Parameters, Filtering, Prediction and Smoothing of Dynamic Models"

Exercise 1 Let us consider the following ARMA model

$$\left. \begin{array}{c} x_{n+1} = ax_n + bu_n + \zeta_n, \\ \zeta_n = \xi_n + d_1\xi_{n-1} + d_2\xi_{n-2}, \\ x_n, u_n, \zeta_n \in \mathbb{R}^1, \ n = 0, 1, \dots, \end{array} \right\}$$
(1)

with

$$\left. \begin{array}{c} a = 0.5, \ b = 1, \ d_1 = 0.3, \ d_2 = -0.33, \\ x_0 = 5, \ u_n = \sin\left(0.3n\right), \end{array} \right\}$$
(2)

and $\{\xi_n\}_{n=0,1...}$ is a stationary sequence of **independent Gaussian** random variables satisfying

$$E \{\xi_n\} = 0, \ E \{\xi_n^2\} = \sigma^2 = 1, E \{\xi_n \xi_k\} \stackrel{n \neq k}{=} 0, \ E \{\xi_n x_n\} = 0, E \{\xi_n u_n\} = E \{\xi_{n-1} u_n\} = E \{\xi_{n-2} u_n\} = 0.$$
(3)

The model (1) can be represented in the generalized regression format as

$$\left\{\begin{array}{c}
x_{n+1} = c^{\mathsf{T}} z_n + \zeta_n, \\
c := \begin{pmatrix} a \\ b \end{pmatrix}, z_n := \begin{pmatrix} x_n \\ u_n \end{pmatrix} - \text{ generalized regression vector.} \end{array}\right\}$$
(4)

Problem: estimate the vector c using in each time n the observations (x_{n+1}, z_n) .

To do that let us apply the Instrumental Variable (IV) estimation algorithm

$$c_{n+1} = c_n + \Gamma_n v_n \left(x_{n+1} - z_n^{\mathsf{T}} c_n \right), \ c_0 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \\ \Gamma_n = \Gamma_{n-1} - \frac{\Gamma_{n-1} v_n z_n^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n-1}}{1 + z_n^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n-1} v_n}, \ z_n^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n-1} v_n \neq -1, \\ \Gamma_0 = \rho^{-1} I_{2\times 2}, \ \rho = 10^{-5}.$$

$$(5)$$

Notice that

- for $v_n = z_n$ this is **Least Squares Method** (LSM);

- for $v_n = z_{n-2}$ this is Instrumental Variables Method (IVM);

Show (by numerical simulations) that LSM method does not work in this example, but IVM correctly estimates unknown parameter c, namely,

$$c_n \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} c = \begin{pmatrix} 0.5 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Exercise 2 Let us consider the following RAR (Regression-Auto-Regression) model with scalar output x_{n+1} and independent noise sequence $\{\xi_n\}_{n=0,1,\ldots}$:

$$\begin{cases} x_{n+1} = a_0 x_n + b u_n + \xi_n, \\ x_n, u_n, \xi_n \in \mathbb{R}^1, \ n = 0, 1, \dots \end{cases}$$
 (6)

where

$$a_0 = 0.5, \ b = 1, x_0 = 5$$
 (7)

and $\{\xi_n\}_{n=0,1...}$ is a stationary sequence of **independent** random variables

which in generalized regression format can be represented as

$$x_{n+1} = c^{\mathsf{T}} z_n + \xi_n,$$

$$c := \begin{pmatrix} a_0 \\ b \end{pmatrix}, \ z_n := \begin{pmatrix} x_n \\ u_n \end{pmatrix} - \text{ generalized regression vector.}$$
(9)

Problem: Find the Cramer-Rao information low-bound, that is, calculate the right-hand side of the matrix inequality

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} n \mathsf{E}\left\{ (c_n - c) (c_n - c)^\mathsf{T} \right\} \ge \mathcal{I} = \lim_{n \to \infty} n \mathbb{I}_F^{-1}(c, n)$$
(10)

valid for any estimates c_n as a function of all the observations $(x_1, z_0; ..., x_{n+1}, z_n)$ available at time n for two cases:

Case a) $\{u_n\}_{n=0,1,\dots}$ is a stationary sequence of independent random variables with Laplace distribution

$$p_u(x) = \frac{1}{a} \exp\left\{-\frac{|x|}{a}\right\}, \ a = 2;$$

and $\{\xi_n\}_{n=0,1,\dots}$ is a stationary sequence of independent random variables with Gaussian distribution

$$p_{\xi}(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\sigma}} \exp\left\{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma}\right\}, \ \sigma = 1;$$

Case b) $\{u_n\}_{n=0,1,\ldots}$ is a stationary sequence of independent random variables with **Gaussian distribution**

$$p_{\xi}(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\sigma}} \exp\left\{-\frac{x^2}{2\sigma}\right\}, \ \sigma = 1;$$

and $\{\xi_n\}_{n=0,1,\dots}$ is a stationary sequence of independent random variables with Laplace distribution

$$p_u(x) = \frac{1}{2a} \exp\left\{-\frac{|x|}{a}\right\}, \ a = 2;$$

Remark: Simulations are not required, only numerical calculation of the information low-bounds.

Hint (help): use the following result.

Theorem 3 If in the model (9) with i.i.d. (independent identically distributed) centered "noise" sequence $\{\xi_n\}$ the generalized inputs $\{z_n\}$ satisfy the following conditions

1) "strong law of large number " (SLNL) for $\{z_n\}$

$$\left\| \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=0}^{n} \{ z_t z_t^{\mathsf{T}} \} - \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=0}^{n} \mathsf{E} \{ z_t z_t^{\mathsf{T}} \} \right\| \stackrel{a.s.}{\underset{n \to \infty}{\to}} 0 \tag{11}$$

2) the convergence of "averaged" inputs covariation

$$\frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=0}^{n}\mathsf{E}\left\{z_{t}z_{t}^{\mathsf{T}}\right\} \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{} \mathcal{R} > 0$$
(12)

3) z_n (under a fixed prehistory $z^{n-1} := (z_1, ..., z_{n-1})$ and fixed x_n) does not depend on c, that is,

$$\nabla_c \ln p_{z_n} \left(v_n^z \mid x_n, z^{t-1}, c \right) = 0 \ (n = 1, ...)$$

then the information bound under the regular data $y_n := (x_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}}, z_n^{\mathsf{T}})^{\mathsf{T}} \in \mathbb{R}^{1+K}$ is

$$\mathcal{I} = \lim_{n \to \infty} n \mathbb{I}_F^{-1}(c, n) = \mathcal{R}^{-1} I_F^{-1}(p_{\xi})$$
(13)

where

$$I_{F}(p_{\xi}) := \mathsf{E}\left\{\left[\left(\ln p_{\xi}\left(\xi\right)\right)'\right]^{2}\right\} = \int_{v \in R} \frac{\left[\frac{d}{dv}p_{\xi}(v)\right]^{2}}{p_{\xi}(v)} dv$$
(14)

Fisher information is

a) for Gaussian noise
$$\xi_n : I_F(p_{\xi}) = \sigma^{-2}$$
, $\mathsf{E}\left\{\xi_t^2\right\} = \sigma^2$,
b) for Laplace noise $\xi_n : I_F(p_{\xi}) = a^{-2}$, $\mathsf{E}\left\{\xi_t^2\right\} = 2a^2$.

To solve the problem it is sufficient to calculate

$$\mathcal{R} = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=0}^{n} \mathsf{E}\left\{z_{t} z_{t}^{\mathsf{T}}\right\} = \lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=0}^{n} \begin{bmatrix} \mathsf{E}\left\{x_{t}^{2}\right\} & \mathsf{E}\left\{x_{t} u_{t}\right\} \\ \mathsf{E}\left\{u_{t} x_{t}\right\} & \mathsf{E}\left\{u_{t}^{2}\right\} \end{bmatrix}.$$

Exercise 3

Recurrent version of the Maximum Likelihood Estimating Procedure:

$$c_{n} = c_{n-1} - \Gamma_{n} I_{F}^{-1} (p_{\xi}) z_{n} \frac{d}{dv} \ln p_{\xi} \left(x_{n+1} - c_{n-1}^{\mathsf{T}} z_{n} \right)$$

$$\Gamma_{n+1} = \Gamma_{n} - \frac{\Gamma_{n} z_{n+1} z_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n}}{1 + z_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n} z_{n+1}}, \ n \ge n_{0}$$

$$c_{n_{0}} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1} V_{n_{0}}, \ \Gamma_{n_{0}} = \left(\sum_{t=0}^{n_{0}} z_{t} z_{t}^{\mathsf{T}} \right)^{-1} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1}$$
(15)

If for the scalar model (9) the specific conditions hold, then the procedure (15) is asymptotically efficient (the best one) under any regular (not only Gaussian) i.i.d. noise in the dynamics of the system.

Calculate and prepare the corresponding the best nonlinear transformations

$$\varphi(v) = \varphi^*(v) := -\mathbb{I}_F^{-1}(p_{\xi}) \frac{d}{dv} \ln p_{\xi}(v)$$
(16)

(in this case $\mathbb{I}_{F}^{-1}(p_{\xi}) = I_{F}^{-1}(p_{\xi})$ is a scalar) for

a) Laplace noise density

$$p_{\xi}(v) = \frac{1}{2a} \exp\left\{-\frac{|v|}{a}\right\}, \ a = 1; \ I_F(p_{\xi}) = a^{-2}$$

b) \cos^2 noise density

$$p_{\xi}(v) = \begin{cases} \frac{\pi}{a} \cos^2\left(\frac{\pi}{2a} (v-c)\right) & \text{for} \quad |v-c| \le a\\ 0 & \text{for} \quad |v-c| > a \end{cases}, \ a = 1, \ I_F(p_{\xi}) = \left(\frac{\pi}{a}\right)^2$$

Take c = 0.

Exercise 4

Consider the following system

$$\begin{array}{c}
y(k) = 0.85y(k-1) + 2u(k) + \eta(k), \\
y(0) = 3, \eta(0) = \xi(0) = 0, \\
\eta(k) = -0.3\eta(k-1) + \xi(k) + 0.8\xi(k-1), \\
u(k) = \sin(0.2k),
\end{array}$$
(17)

with ξ as an independent random sequence having the *Logistic distribution*

$$p_{\xi}(v \mid \mu, \sigma) = \frac{\exp\left\{\frac{v - \mu}{\sigma}\right\}}{\sigma\left(1 + \exp\left\{\frac{v - \mu}{\sigma}\right\}\right)^2}, \quad -\infty < x < \infty$$
(18)

where $\mu \in (-\infty, \infty)$ is mean value and σ which is a scalar parameter. For simulation take

$$\mu = 0, \ \sigma = 1.$$

The system (17) can be rewritten as follows

$$\left. \begin{array}{c} y(k) = z(k)^{\top}c + \eta(k), \ k = 1, 2, \dots \\ \\ \eta(k) = H(q^{-1})\xi(k), \\ H(q^{-1}) = \frac{1+0.8q^{-1}}{1+0.3q^{-1}}, \ q^{-1}x(k) := x(k-1) \end{array} \right\}$$
(19)

with

$$z(k) = \begin{pmatrix} y(k-1) \\ u(k) \end{pmatrix}, \ c := \begin{pmatrix} 0.85 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

The whitening process is then given by

$$\tilde{y}(k) = H^{-1}(q^{-1})y(k), \ \tilde{z}(k) = H^{-1}(q^{-1})z(k),$$

or in the extended form,

$$\begin{split} & \tilde{y}(k) + 0.8\,\tilde{y}(k-1) = y(k) + 0.3y(k-1), \ \tilde{y}(0) = y(0), \\ & \tilde{z}(k) + 0.8\,\tilde{z}(k-1) = z(k) + 0.3z(k-1), \ \tilde{z}(0) = z(0), \end{split}$$

where the "inverse filter" has the transfer function

$$H^{-1}(q^{-1}) = \frac{1+0.3q^{-1}}{1+0.8q^{-1}}.$$

The recursive WLSM (Whitening-Least-Square-Method) algorithm is

$$c_{n} = c_{n-1} - I_{F,\xi}^{-1} \Gamma_{n} \tilde{z}_{n} \frac{p_{\xi}'(v)}{p_{\xi}(v)} |_{v = \tilde{y}_{n} - \tilde{z}_{n}^{\mathsf{T}} c_{n-1}},$$

$$\Gamma_{n} = \Gamma_{n-1} - \frac{\Gamma_{n-1} \tilde{z}_{n} \tilde{z}_{n}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n-1}}{1 + \tilde{z}_{n}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n-1} \tilde{z}_{n}}, \ n = 1, 2, ..., \ \Gamma(0) = 10^{5}.$$

$$\left. \right\}$$

$$(20)$$

Here we need to calculate the Fisher Information $I_{F,\xi}$. Take c(0) = 2.

Task: To simulate this identification WLSM-process with whitening and without, and demonstrate that LSM without whitening does not work, using Matlab for generating the Logistic distribution:

pd = makedist('Logistic', 'mu', mu, 'sigma', sigma),

and

$$pd = fitdist(x, 'Logistic').$$

Exercise 5 (Recurrent Residual Method (RRM)) Consider the plant

$$\left.\begin{array}{c}
x_{n+1} = ax_n + bu_n + \xi_n + d\xi_{n-1}, \\
x_n, u_n, \xi_n \in \mathbb{R}^1, \ n = 0, 1, \dots, \\
n = 0 : x_0 = 0, \ \xi_{-1} = 0.
\end{array}\right\}$$
(21)

Problem: estimate numerically parameters $c = (a, b, d)^{\mathsf{T}}$, using the algorith

$$c_{n} = c_{n-1} - \Gamma_{n} z_{n} \left(x_{n+1} - c_{n-1}^{\mathsf{T}} z_{n} \right) = c_{n-1} - \Gamma_{n} z_{n} \varepsilon_{n+1},$$

$$\Gamma_{n+1} = \Gamma_{n} - \frac{\Gamma_{n} z_{n+1} z_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n}}{1 + z_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n} z_{n+1}}, \ n \ge n_{0},$$

$$c_{n_{0}} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1} V_{n_{0}}, \ \Gamma_{n_{0}} = \left(\sum_{t=0}^{n_{0}} z_{t} z_{t}^{\mathsf{T}} \right)^{-1} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1},$$
(22)

where

$$z_n = (x_n, u_n, \varepsilon_n)^{\mathsf{T}}, \qquad (23)$$

with the sequence $\{\varepsilon_n\}$ generated by the recurrency

Here ξ_n is the Standard Gaussian random value ($\mathsf{E}\{\xi_n\} = 0, \mathsf{E}\{\xi_n^2\} = \sigma^2$) and real values (used for simulations) of the parameters are:

$$a = 0.5, b = -1, d = -0.7.$$

The input u_n is

$$u_n = 0.6\sin\left(0.1n\right).$$

Present the figures with $c_n = (a_n, b_n, d_n)^{\mathsf{T}}$ and $\Delta_n = \varepsilon_n - \xi_n$ which should satisfy

$$\Delta_n \xrightarrow[n \to \infty]{a.s.} 0.$$

Exercise 6 (Huber's robust identifiers)

In the case of dynamic *autoregression* model (ARX-model) where the generalized inputs are dependent on the state of the system, the matrix \mathcal{R} depends on p_{ξ} too, and therefore, we deal with the complete problem (??), namely, we need to calculate

$$\sup_{p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}} \left[I_{F,\xi} \left(p_{\xi} \right) \mathcal{R} \left(p_{\xi} \right) \right]^{-1}$$
(25)

and to find the worth distribution p_{ξ}^{*} within the considered class $\mathcal{P}.$ For the AR-model

$$y_{n+1} = \sum_{s=0}^{L_a} a_s y_{n-s} + \xi_n = \mathbf{c}^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{v}_n + \xi_n$$
$$\mathbf{c}^{\mathsf{T}} = (a_0, ..., a_{L_a}), \ \mathbf{v}_n^{\mathsf{T}} = (y_n, y_{n-1}, ..., y_{n-L_a})$$

we have

$$\frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=0}^{n}\mathsf{E}\left\{\mathbf{v}_{t}\mathbf{v}_{t}^{\mathsf{T}}\right\}\to\mathcal{R}$$

where \mathcal{R} satisfies

$$\mathcal{R} = A\mathcal{R}A + \sigma^2 \Xi_0$$

with

Obviously, ${\mathcal R}$ can be represented as

$$\mathcal{R} = \sigma^2 \mathcal{R}_0,$$

where \mathcal{R}_0 is the solution of

$$\mathcal{R} = A\mathcal{R}A + \Xi_0$$

so that the problem (25) is reduced to

$$\sup_{p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}} \left[\sigma^{2} \left(p_{\xi} \right) I_{F} \left(p_{\xi} \right) \right]^{-1}$$

or equivalently, to

$$\underbrace{\inf_{p_{\xi}\in\mathcal{P}}\left[\sigma^{2}\left(p_{\xi}\right)I_{F}\left(p_{\xi}\right)\right]}$$
(26)

Problem: to design the asymptotically robust optimal identification algorithm in the format

$$\mathbf{c}_{n} = \mathbf{c}_{n-1} - \Gamma_{n} \mathbf{v}_{n} I_{F}^{-1} \left(p_{\xi}^{*} \right) \frac{d}{dv} \ln p_{\xi}^{*} \left(v \right) |_{v=x_{n+1}-\mathbf{c}_{n-1}^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{v}_{n}},$$

$$\Gamma_{n+1} = \Gamma_{n} - \frac{\Gamma_{n} \mathbf{v}_{n+1} \mathbf{v}_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n}}{1 + \mathbf{v}_{n+1}^{\mathsf{T}} \Gamma_{n} \mathbf{v}_{n+1}}, \quad n \ge n_{0},$$

$$c_{n_{0}} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1} V_{n_{0}}, \quad \Gamma_{n_{0}} = \left(\sum_{t=0}^{n_{0}} z_{t} z_{t}^{\mathsf{T}} \right)^{-1} = Z_{n_{0}}^{-1},$$
(27)

where

$$p_{\xi}^{*}(v) = \arg \inf_{p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}} \left[\sigma^{2} \left(p_{\xi} \right) I_{F} \left(p_{\xi} \right) \right]$$

for the AR model

$$\left. \begin{array}{c} x_{n+1} = a_0 x_n + a_1 x_{n-1} + \xi_n, \\ \\ x_n, \xi_n \in R^1, \ n = 0, 1, ..., \\ \\ a_0 = 0.5, a_1 = 0.3, x_0 = -1, x_{-1} = 0 \end{array} \right\}$$

with noise ξ_n from the class **Class** \mathcal{P}_2^{AR} (containing all centered distributions with a variance not less than a given value):

$$\mathcal{P}_{2}^{AR} := \left\{ p_{\xi} : \int_{\mathbb{R}} x^{2} p_{\xi} \left(x \right) dx \ge \sigma_{0}^{2} \right\}.$$

$$(28)$$

and in the same time from the class **Class** \mathcal{P}_1 (of all symmetric distributions nonsingular in the point x = 0):

$$\mathcal{P}_{1} := \left\{ p_{\xi} : p_{\xi}(0) \ge \frac{1}{2a} > 0 \right\},$$
(29)

that is

$$p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}_2^{AR} \cap \mathcal{P}_1.$$

Hint:

Lemma 4 (on the class \mathcal{P}_2^{AR})

$$p_{\xi}^{*}(x) = \arg \inf_{p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}_{2}^{AR}: \sigma^{2}(p_{\xi}) = \sigma_{0}^{2}} I_{F}(p_{\xi}), \qquad (30)$$

that is, the worth on \mathcal{P}_2^{AR} distribution density $p_{\xi}^*(x)$ coincides with the worth distribution density on the classes \mathcal{P}_i characterizing distribution uncertainties for **static** (*R*-models) provided that

$$\sigma^2\left(p_{\xi}^*\left(x\right)\right) = \sigma_0^2. \tag{31}$$

Proof. It follows directly from the inequality

$$\sigma^2(p_{\xi}) I_F(p_{\xi}) \ge \sigma_0^2 I_F(p_{\xi}).$$

Lemma 5 (on the class \mathcal{P}_1)

$$p_{\xi}^{*}(x) = \arg \inf_{p_{\xi} \in \mathcal{P}_{1}} I_{F}(p_{\xi}) = \frac{1}{2a} \exp\left\{-\frac{|x|}{a}\right\},$$
(32)

that is, the worth on \mathcal{P}_1 distribution density is the Laplace one given by (32).

Any numerical simulations are not required! Only you need to give the analitical formula for

$$I_F^{-1}\left(p_{\xi}^*\right)\frac{d}{dv}\ln p_{\xi}^*\left(v\right)$$

in the algorithm (27).

Exercise 7 (Kalman's filtering)

Consider the stochastic system

$$dx(t) = [Ax(t) + b(t)] dt + \Xi dW_x(t), \ x(0) = x_0,$$

$$dy(t) = c^{\mathsf{T}} x(t) dt + r dW_y(t), \ r > 0,$$
(33)

where $W_x(t)$ and $W_y(t)$ are standard (with unite variance) independent Wiener processes.

For the simulation in Simulink here may be used the, so-called, *engineering* presentation of this system as

$$\begin{split} \dot{x}\left(t\right) &= Ax(t) + b(t) + \sigma\xi_{x}\left(t\right), \ x(0) = x_{0}, \\ \dot{y}(t) &= c^{\intercal}x(t) + r\xi_{y}\left(t\right), \ r > 0, \end{split}$$

where $\xi_x(t)$ and $\xi_y(t)$ are associated gaussian white noises (with zero mean and variance equal 1), namely,

$$\xi_x(t) \sim \frac{d}{dt} W_x(t), \ \xi_y(t) \sim \frac{d}{dt} W_y(t)$$

(which do not exist in rigorous mathematical sense).

To estimate the current states $\hat{x}(t)$ let us apply the Kalman filter

$$d\hat{x}(t) = [A\hat{x}(t) + b(t)] dt + L(t) [dy_t(t) - c^{\mathsf{T}}\hat{x}(t) dt], \hat{x}_0 \text{ is fixed.}$$
(34)

that In the engineering interpretation it looks as

$$\frac{d}{dt}\hat{x}(t) = A\hat{x}(t) + b(t) + L(t)\left[\frac{d}{dt}y_t(t) - c^{\mathsf{T}}\hat{x}(t)\right], \, \hat{x}_0 \text{ is fixed.}$$
(35)

We assume that $\frac{d}{dt}y_{t}(t)$ is available! Here

$$L(t) = L^{*}(t) := r^{-2}P(t)c,$$

where

$$P(t) = \mathsf{E}\left\{\Delta x(t)\,\Delta^{\mathsf{T}} x(t)\right\}$$
(37)

(36)

satisfies the following differential Riccati equation

$$\dot{P}(t) = AP(t) + P(t) A^{\mathsf{T}} + \Xi^{\mathsf{T}} - r^{-2}P(t) cc^{\mathsf{T}}P(t),$$

$$P(0) = \mathsf{E} \left\{ \Delta x(0) \Delta^{\mathsf{T}} x(0) \right\}$$
(38)

For simulation take

$$x(t) \in R^2, \ A = \begin{bmatrix} -1 & 1 \\ 0 & -2 \end{bmatrix}, \ \Xi = 0.5 \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}, \ r = 0.9,$$
$$x(0) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix}, \ b(t) = 0.6 \begin{pmatrix} \sin(0.5t) \\ \cos(0.5t) \end{pmatrix}, \ P(0) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}.$$

To analyze 3 situations:

1)
$$c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix}$$
, 2) $c = \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$, 3) $c = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix}$

and for each of them to draw the pictures

$$\hat{x}(t) = \begin{pmatrix} \hat{x}_1(t) \\ \hat{x}_2(t) \end{pmatrix}, x(t) = \begin{pmatrix} x_1(t) \\ x_2(t) \end{pmatrix}$$

 $(\hat{x}_{i}(t) \text{ and } x_{i}(t) \text{ in the same graphic) and}$

$$\operatorname{tr}\left\{ P\left(t\right) \right\} =\mathsf{E}\left\{ \left\| \Delta x\left(t\right) \right\| ^{2}\right\} .$$